

Distinguishing between *Ille* and *Iipse* as Demonstratives, Definite Articles and Personal Pronouns in Late Latin

1. Introduction/Data

Latin:

No definite articles or third person personal pronouns.

The Romance languages:

Both definite articles and third person pronouns.

Most Romance languages have definite articles and third person pronouns derived from *ille*, originally a distal demonstrative, ‘that’. Some Romance varieties have definite articles and third person pronouns derived from *ipse*, ‘(him)self’, ‘(the) very’.

Late Latin:

Ille and *ipse* are sometimes demonstratives, sometimes definite articles and sometimes third person pronouns.

Data from the PROIEL corpus.¹ Two Late Latin texts, both (presumably) from the late fourth / early fifth century:

- Jerome’s Vulgate translation of the New Testament
- The *Peregrinatio Aetheriae* (or *Itinerarium Egeriae*)

2. Some Criteria for Distinguishing between Demonstratives, Third Person Pronouns and Definite Articles

2.1. Cooccurrence with a Noun² or not

2.1.1. *Ille/Iipse* Used Pronominally

Third person pronoun or demonstrative.

Pronominal *ille*:

- (1) *et exurgens summus sacerdos in medium interrogavit Iesum dicens non respondes quicquam ad ea quae tibi obiciuntur ab his ille autem tacebat et nihil respondit ille autem tacebat et nihil respondit*
 ‘And the high priest stood up in the midst, and asked Jesus, saying, Answerest thou nothing? what *is it which* these witness against thee? But he held his peace, and answered nothing.’³ (Vulg. Mk. 14:61)

Pronominal *ipse*:

- (2) *cum sublevasset ergo oculos Iesus et vidisset quia multitudo maxima venit ad eum dicit ad Philippum unde ememus panes ut manducent hii hoc autem dicebat temptans eum ipse enim sciebat quid esset facturus*

¹ <http://foni.uio.no:3000>

² The term ‘noun’ is used here in the broad sense to include substantivized adjectives.

³ Bible translations are from the King James Bible.

‘When Jesus then lifted up *his* eyes, and saw a great company come unto him, he saith unto Philip, Whence shall we buy bread, that these may eat? And this he said to prove him: for he himself knew what he would do.’ (Vulg. John 6:5-6)

2.1.2. *Ille/Ipse* Used Adnominally

Ille/ipse are either definite articles or demonstratives.

Ille and *ipse* are used adnominally in the following example:

- (3) *Tunc ergo quia retinebam scriptum esse baptizasse sanctum Iohannem in Enon iuxta Salim, requisivi de eo, quam longe esset ipse locus. Tunc ait ille sanctus presbyter:* ‘Then, because I remembered that it was written that S. John had baptized in Aenon near to Salim, I asked him how far off the place was. Then the holy priest answered’ (Per. Aeth. XI,1)

2.2. Discontinuity in the Noun Phrase

Definite articles are clitics that cannot be separated from the noun to which they belong by an element not belonging to the noun phrase.

Ipse can therefore not be a real definite article in e.g. (4) and (5):

- (4) *Ipsam ergo uallem nos trauersare habebamus ut possimus montem Dei ingredi.* ‘We had, therefore, to cross that valley in order to reach the mountain of God.’ (Per. Aeth. II,1)
- (5) *ipsa vero ciuitas auro mundo simile vitro mundo* ‘and the city *was* pure gold, like unto clear glass.’ (Vulg. Rev. 21:18)

2.3. The Relative Order of *Ille/Ipse* and the Noun

Ille and *ipse* developed into *preposed* articles in all the Romance varieties except Rumanian.⁴

The article tends to precede the noun in VO languages (Dryer 1992: 103-104).

The word order in the Vulgate and in the *Peregrinatio Aetheriae* is overwhelmingly VO rather than OV.

Thus, the most likely candidates for being articles are preposed *ille* and *ipse*.

Postposed and preposed *ipse*:

- (6) *Eamus nunc ad portam, per quam ingressus est Ananias cursor cum illa epistola, quam dixeram. Cum ergo uenissemus ad portam ipsam, stans episcopus fecit orationem et legit nobis ibi ipsas epistolas et denuo benedicens nos facta est iterato oratio. Illud etiam retulit nobis sanctus ipse dicens, eo quod ex ea die, qua Ananias cursor per ipsam portam ingressus est cum epistolam Domini usque in praesentem diem custodiatur [...]*

‘Let us now go to the gate by which Ananias the courier entered with the letter of which I spoke.’ So when we had come to the gate, the bishop, standing, made a prayer and read us the letters; then, after he had blessed us, another prayer was made.

⁴ The postposed article in Rumanian is most likely a feature of the Balkan Sprachbund having nothing to do with the Latin language.

Moreover the holy man told us that from the day on which Ananias the courier entered it with the letter of the Lord, the gate is kept to this day,' (Per. Aeth. XIX,16-17)

Preposed *ille*:

- (7) *is autem qui sanus fuerat effectus nesciebat quis esset Iesus enim declinavit turba constituta in loco postea invenit eum Iesus in templo et dixit illi ecce sanus factus es iam noli peccare ne deterius tibi aliquid contingat abiit ille homo et nuntiavit Iudaeis quia Iesus esset qui fecit eum sanum*

‘And he that was healed wist not who it was: for Jesus had conveyed himself away, a multitude being in *that* place. Afterward Jesus findeth him in the temple, and said unto him, Behold, thou art made whole: sin no more, lest a worse thing come unto thee. The man departed, and told the Jews that it was Jesus, which had made him whole.’ (Vulg. John 5:15)

Postposed *ille*:

- (8) *Certe locum cum uideremus, columnam nullam uidimus, et ideo fallere uos super hanc rem non possum. Nam episcopus loci ipsius, id est de Segor, dixit nobis, quoniam iam aliquot anni essent, a quo non pareret columna illa*

‘Certainly when we saw the place we saw no pillar, I cannot therefore deceive you in this. The bishop of the place, that is of Segor, told us that it is now some years since the pillar could be seen.’ (Per. Aeth. XII,7)

2.4. The Topicality of the Referent

2.4.1. Pronominal Demonstratives and Third Person Pronouns

Pronominal demonstratives are said to indicate a topic shift, whereas weak third person pronouns express topic continuity (e.g. Givón 1983, Gundel et al. 1993, Lambrecht 1994, Comrie 2000).

Thus:

Pronominal *ille/ipse* expressing topic shift: Demonstratives

Pronominal *ille/ipse* expressing topic continuity: Third person pronouns

Topic shift:

- (9) *vespere autem facto venit cum duodecim et discumbentibus eis et manducantibus ait Iesus amen dico vobis quia unus ex vobis me tradet qui manducat mecum at illi coeperunt contristari et dicere ei singillatim*

‘And in the evening he cometh with the twelve. And as they sat and did eat, Jesus said, Verily I say unto you, One of you which eateth with me shall betray me. And they began to be sorrowful, and to say unto him one by one’ (Vulg. Mk. 14:17-19)
(With *illi* the topic shifts from Jesus to the apostles (?))

- (10) *et ecce motus magnus factus est in mari ita ut navicula operiretur fluctibus ipse vero dormiebat*

‘And, behold, there arose a great tempest in the sea, insomuch that the ship was covered with the waves: but he was asleep.’ (Vulg. Mt. 8:24)
(The topic shifts from the ship to Jesus)

Topic continuity:

- (11) *et surgens venit ad patrem suum cum autem adhuc longe esset vidit illum pater ipsius*

‘And he arose, and came to his father. But when he was yet a great way off, his father saw him’ (Vulg. Lk. 15:20)
 (The son is the topic of the first sentence, and *illum* continues this topic)

2.4.2. Adnominal Demonstratives and Definite Articles

Topic continuity vs. topic shift seems to describe the relation between definite articles and adnominal demonstratives as well.

Thus:

Adnominal *ille/ipse* expressing topic shift: Demonstratives

Adnominal *ille/ipse* expressing topic continuity: Definite articles

Topic shift:

- (12) *consilio autem inuito emerunt ex illis agrum figuli in sepulturam peregrinorum propter hoc vocatus est ager ille Acheldemach ager sanguinis usque in hodiernum diem*
 ‘And they [i.e. the chief priests] took counsel, and bought with them the potter’s field, to bury strangers in. Wherefore that field was called, The field of blood, unto this day.’
 (Vulg. Mt. 27:7-8)

(With *ager ille* the topic shifts from the chief priests to the field)

- (13) *Locus etiam, ubi fuit titulus uxoris Loth, ostensus est nobis, qui locus etiam in scripturis legitur. Sed mihi credite, domine uenerabiles, quia columna ipsa iam non paret, locus autem ipse tantum ostenditur:*

‘The place where was the inscription concerning Lot’s wife was shown to us, which place is read of in the Scriptures. But believe me, reverend ladies, the pillar itself cannot be seen, but only that place is shown’ (Per. Aeth. VII,6-7)

(with *locus ipse* the place is made the topic)

Topic continuity:

- (14) *Ipsa ergo cum se dignatus fuisset uexare et ibi nobis occurrere, singula ibi ostendit seu retulit de illas statuas, quas dixi, ut etiam et de illa arbore sicomori. Nam et hoc nobis ipse sanctus episcopus retulit*

‘He, after deigning to give himself the trouble of meeting us, showed us everything there and told us about the aforesaid statues, as well as about the sycamore tree. Also this the holy bishop told us:’ (Per. Aeth. VIII,5)

(The bishop is the topic of the first sentence, and *ipse sanctus episcopus* continues this topic)

2.5. Cognitive Status

The Givenness Hierarchy (Gundel et al. 1993)

In focus (zero and unstressed pronominals)

↓

Activated (stressed pronominals, *that, this, this N*)

↓

Familiar (*that N*)

↓

Uniquely identifiable (*the N*)

↓

Referential (indefinite *this N*)

↓

Type identifiable (*a N*)

- In focus:

The referent is at the current centre of attention. I take ‘in focus’ to be a wider notion than ‘topic’.

- Activated:

The referent is represented in current short-term memory, but is not at the current centre of attention.

- Familiar:

The referent is represented in the addressee’s (short-term or long-term) memory.

- Uniquely identifiable:

The addressee can identify the speaker’s intended referent on the basis of the nominal alone.

- Referential:

The speaker intends to refer to a particular object or objects. The addressee must either retrieve an existing representation of the referent or construct a new representation by the time the sentence has been processed.

- Type identifiable:

The addressee is able to identify the type of object described by the expression.

2.5.1. Pronominal Demonstratives and Third Person Pronouns

Unstressed pronouns requires the status ‘in focus’.

Pronominal demonstratives and stressed pronouns only require ‘activated’.

With referents in focus, *ille/ipse* are likely to be unstressed third person pronouns.

If the referent is activated, *ille/ipse* are more likely to be demonstratives (or stressed third person pronouns).

Referent in focus:

- (15) *fu*t Iohannes in deserto baptizans et praedicans baptismum paenitentiae in remissionem peccatorum et egrediebatur ad illum omnis Iudaeae regio et Hierosolymitae universi et baptizabantur ab illo in Iordane flumine confitentes peccata sua

‘John did baptize in the wilderness, and preach the baptism of repentance for the remission of sins. And there went out unto him all the land of Judaea, and they of

Jerusalem, and were all baptized of him in the river of Jordan, confessing their sins.’
 (Vulg. Mk. 1:4-5)
 (The passage is about John – he is at the current centre of attention)

Referent activated:

- (16) *cum autem turba plurima conveniret et de civitatibus properarent ad eum dixit per similitudinem [parable of 63 tokens omitted] interrogabant autem eum discipuli eius quae esset haec parabola quibus ipse dixit*
 ‘And when much people were gathered together, and were come to him out of every city, he spake by a parable: And his disciples asked him, saying, What might this parable be? And he said’ (Vulg. Lk. 8:4-10)
 (Jesus is not in the current centre of attention because of the small, intervening parable, but he *is* represented in short term memory – thus activated)

2.5.2. Adnominal Demonstratives and Definite Articles

The relation between anaphoric adnominal demonstratives and anaphoric definite articles, seen as isolated from the other forms in the hierarchy, is not captured very well by the givenness hierarchy.

The difference does not lie in uniquely identifiable vs. familiar, but in ‘in focus or activated’ vs. ‘not in focus or activated’. The longer the distance to the antecedent, the more likely *ille/ipse* are to be demonstratives rather than articles.

In focus:

- (17) *Et quoniam nobis iter sic erat, ut per ualle illa media, qua tenditur per longum, iremus, id est illa ualle, quam superius dixi, ubi sederant filii Israhel, dum Moyses ascenderet in montem Dei et descenderet: itaque ergo singula, quem ad modum uenimus per ipsam totam uallem, semper nobis sancti illi loca demonstrabant. Nam in primo capite ipsius uallis, ubi manseramus et uideramus rubum illum, de quo locutus est Deus sancto Moysi in igne, uideramus etiam et illum locum, in quo steterat ante rubum sanctus Moyses, quando ei dixit Deus:*
 ‘And as our route lay through the middle and along the length of the valley--the same valley, as I said above, where the children of Israel sojourned while Moses ascended into the mount of God and descended thence--so the holy men showed us each place that we came to in the whole valley. At the top of the head of the valley where we had stayed and had seen the bush out of which God spake in the fire to holy Moses, we had seen also the spot on which holy Moses had stood before the bush when God said to him.’ (Per. Aeth. 5,I)
 (The passage is primarily about the valley, so it is at the current centre of attention)

Activated:

- (18) *Cum ergo iubente Deo persubissemus in ipsa summitate et peruenissemus ad hostium ipsius ecclesiae, ecce et occurrit presbyter ueniens de monasterio suo, qui ipsi ecclesie deputabatur, senex integer et monachus a prima uita et, ut hic dicunt, ascitis et (quid plura?) qualis dignus est esse in eo loco. Occurrerunt etiam et alii presbyteri, nec non etiam et omnes monachi, qui ibi commorabantur iuxta montem illum, id est qui tamen aut etate aut inbeccillitate non fuerunt impediti.*
 ‘When, therefore, at God’s bidding, we had arrived at the summit [of the mount Sinai], and had reached the door of the church, lo, the priest who was appointed to the church came from his cell and met us, a hale old man, a monk from early life, and an ascetic as

they say here, in short one worthy to be in that place; the other priests also met us, together with all the monks who dwelt on the mountain, that is, not hindered by age or infirmity.’ (Per. Aeth. III,4)

(The mount of God is represented in short-term memory, but is not at the current centre of attention)

Not activated or in focus (Familiar):

(19) *Nobis ergo euntibus ab eo loco, ubi uenientes a Faran feceramus orationem, iter sic fuit, ut per medium transuersarem caput ipsius uallis et sic plecaremus nos ad montem Dei [44 sentences omitted] necesse nos erat et loca omnia sancta ambulare et monasteria, quaecumque erant ibi, uidere et sic ad uallis illius, quam superius dixi, caput exire, id est huius uallis, quae subiacet monti Dei.*

‘In the meanwhile we came on foot to a certain place where the mountains, through which we were journeying, opened out and formed an infinitely great valley, quite flat and extraordinarily beautiful, and across the valley appeared Sinai, the holy mountain of God. It was necessary that we should walk past and see all the holy places and the cells that were there, and thus come out at the head of that valley, as I said above, that is of this valley that lies under the mount of God.’ (Per. Aeth. I,1-IV,5)

(The valley is mentioned so far back as to not being present in short-term memory anymore)

2.6. The Number of Times the Referent has been Mentioned before

As a means for establishing discourse topics, demonstratives are often preferred to definite articles (and to personal pronouns?) when the referent is mentioned for the second time. After a referent has been established as a topic in its second mention, it is later tracked by third person pronouns, zero anaphors, definite articles or pronominal affixes on the verb (Christophersen 1939: 29, Diessel 1999: 98).

(20) *Interea ambulantes peruenimus ad quendam locum, ubi se tamen montes illi se aperiebant et faciebant uallem infinitam, ingens, planissima et ualde pulchram, et trans uallem apparebat mons sanctus Dei Syna. [5 sentences omitted] Vallis autem ipsa ingens est ualde [...]*

‘In the meanwhile we came on foot to a certain place where the mountains, through which we were journeying, opened out and formed an infinitely great valley, quite flat and extraordinarily beautiful, and across the valley appeared Sinai, the holy mountain of God. For that valley is indeed very great’ (Per. Aeth. I,1-II,1)

3. Summing Up

Some properties of the noun phrase relevant for distinguishing between *ille/ipse* as demonstratives, *ille/ipse* as definite articles and *ille/ipse* as third person pronouns are the following:

- Whether or not *ille/ipse* occur together with a noun
- Whether there is some element intervening between *ille/ipse* and the noun
- The relative order of *ille/ipse* and the noun
- The topicality of the referent
- The cognitive status of the referent
- The number of times the referent has been mentioned before

References

- Christophersen, P. 1939. *The articles: A study of their theory and use in English*. Copenhagen: Einar Munksgaard.
- Comrie, B. 2000. "Pragmatic binding: demonstratives as anaphors in Dutch". *Proceedings of the Twenty-third Annual Meeting of the Berkeley Linguistics Society, February 14-17, 1997* ed. by Matthew L. Juge & Jeri L. Moxley, 50-61. Berkeley: Berkeley Linguistics Society.
- Diessel, H. 1999. *Demonstratives: Form, function and grammaticalization*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Dryer, Matthew S. 1992. "The greenbergian word order correlations". *Language* 68, 81-138.
- Givón, T. 1983. *Topic continuity in discourse: A quantitative cross-language study*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Gundel, J., N. Hedberg & R. Zacharski. 1993. "Cognitive status and the form of referring expressions in discourse". *Language* 69, 274-307.
- Lambrecht, K. 1994. *Information structure and sentence form. Topic, focus and the mental representation of discourse referents*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lyons, Ch. 1999. *Definiteness*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.