

Bibliography: Hugh MacColl

Michael Astroh and Johan W. Klüwer

November 1999

Introduction

The present bibliography was prepared in the context of *The MacColl Project*, a project initiated by Michael Astroh, Greifswald University, in 1996 to research and publish the works of the Scottish logician Hugh MacColl (1837–1909). The project is carried out as a cooperation between the philosophical institutes of Greifswald University, Germany and the University of Oslo, Norway.

While certainly the most complete bibliography of Hugh MacColl's works yet, this document represents a work in progress. A significant number of new entries have been added to the list in the last few years, and regular additions are to be expected for some time still. We have chosen to publish the bibliography in its present form because we believe the advantages of having it available outweigh the disadvantages of incompleteness. We will much appreciate responses from readers—notifications of errors in the list, and in particular of items that should be added to it. Updates will be published regularly.

In 1993, C. Thiel and V. Peckhaus of the Friedrich-Alexander University of Erlangen, Germany, provided to the MacColl project an extensive bibliography of MacColl's works. This work was in large part based on the research of A. Christie, one of their collaborators. We are highly grateful for this assistance.

The list of entries presented here is sorted by year of publication. We intend to add a version ordered by place of publication, in addition to more information on the sources. The database from which the list was prepared will also be made available, in BibTeX format, possibly along with the programs used to prepare this document from the database.

This bibliography is published on the web site of *Nordic Journal of Philosophical Logic* (NJPL) in connection with the proceedings of the conference *Hugh MacColl and the Tradition of Logic*, held in Greifswald March 29–April 1, 1998. The proceedings, like all issues of NJPL, are provided free of charge. A main goal of the MacColl Project is the publication of a comprehensive critical edition, *Hugh MacColl's Writings on Logic, Philosophy, and Mathematics*.

In the list, "Educational Times Reprints" abbreviates *Mathematical Questions with their solutions, From the "Educational Times"*. The sources for MacColl's letters are: The Jevons Archive, The John Rylands University Library, University of Manchester; The Charles S. Peirce Papers, Harvard College Library, Houghton Library, Cambridge, Massachusetts; and Russell Archives, Hamilton, Ontario.

Michael Astroh and Johan W. Klüwer
Greifswald and Oslo, November 9, 1999.

1865*The Educational Times*, vol. 18

- [Question No.] 1709, p. 20
 [Question No.] 1739, p. 69
 [Question No.] 1761, p. 94
 [Question No.] 1788, p. 114
 [Question No.] 1830, p. 166
 Solution [to Question No. 1739], p. 211

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 4

- [Question no.] 1709, p. 57
 Solution [to Question No. 1709], pp. 57–58
 [Question no.] 1739, p. 102
 [Question no.] 1761, pp. 102–103
 Solution [to Question no. 1739], p. 102
 Solution [to Question no. 1761], pp. 103–105
 On the Numerical Solution of Equations.
 (Continued from the Solutions of Questions
 1739, 1761.), pp. 105–107

1866*The Educational Times*, vol. 19

- Angular and Linear Notation. A Common
 Basis for the *Bilinear* (a Transformation of
 the *Cartesian*), the *Trilinear*, the
Quadrilinear, &c., Systems of Geometry, p.
 20
 [Question No.] 2008, p. 89
 [Question No.] 2245, p. 134
 [Question No.] 1898, p. 258

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 5

- Angular and Linear Notation. A Common
 Basis for the *Bilinear* (a transformation of
 the *Cartesian*), the *Trilinear*, the
Quadrilinear, &c., Systems of Geometry,
 pp. 74–77
 Solution [to Question No. 1950], pp.
 105–107

1870

*Algebraical Exercises and Problems with
 Elliptical Solutions*, Longmans, Green and
 Co., London

The Educational Times, vol. 23

- Formulae of Reduction
 [Question No.] 3209, p. 135
 Solution [to Question No. 3207], p. 159
 [Question No.] 3264, p. 185
 [Question No.] 3292, p. 209

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 14

- An easy way of remembering the *Formulae
 of Reduction* in the Integral Calculus, both
 as regards their Investigation and their
 Application, pp. 43–45
 Solution [to Question No. 3210], p. 73

1871*The Educational Times*, vol. 23

- Probability Notation, pp. 230–231
 Solution [to Question No. 3279], p. 231
 [Question No.] 3322, p. 232
 Solution [to Question No. 1100], pp.
 259–260
 [Question No.] 3342, p. 261
 Solution [to Question No. 3322], p. 288
 [Question No.] 3370, p. 290

The Educational Times, vol. 24

- Solution [to Question No. 3342], p. 19
 Solution [to Question No. 3385], p. 40
 Solution [to Question No. 3292], p. 64
 [Question No.] 3433, p. 69
 Probability Notation No. 2, pp. 111–112
 Solution [to Question No. 3440], p. 112
 [Question No.] 3342, p. 163
 [Question No.] 3515, p. 188
 Solution [to Question No. 3515], p. 188
 Solution [to Question No. 3433], p. 189
 Solution [to Question No. 3408], p. 216

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 15

- Probability Notation, pp. 20–22
 Solution [to Question No. 3279], p. 23
 Solution [to Question No. 1100], pp. 35–36

[Question No.] 3209, p. 36
 [Question No.] 3264, p. 40
 [Question No.] 3322, p. 55
 Solution [To Question No. 3322], pp. 55–56
 [Question No.] 3342, p. 58
 Solution [To Question No. 3385], pp. 83–85
 Solution [To Question No. 3411], pp.
 102–103
 [Question No.] 3292, p. 104
 [Question No.] 3388, p. 106

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 16

Probability Notation. No. 2, pp. 29–31
 Solution [to Question No. 3440], pp. 31–32
 [Question No.] 3342, p. 68
 Solution [to Question No. 3342], pp. 68–69
 [Question No.] 3515, p. 93
 Solution [to Question No. 3515], p. 93
 [Question No.] 3433, p. 96
 Solution [to Question No. 3433], pp. 96–97
 Solution [to Question No. 3408], p. 103

1872

The Educational Times, vol. 24

Solution [to Question No. 3561], p. 269

The Educational Times, vol. 25

[Question No. 3646], p. 244
 Solution [to Question No. 3644], p. 268
 Solution [to Question No. 3561], p. 269

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 17

Solution [to Question No. 3644], p. 36
 Solution [to Question No. 3561], p. 41

1877

The Educational Times, vol. 30

[Question No.] 5259, p. 21
 [Question No.] 5291, p. 44
 [Question No.] 5318, p. 69
 Symbolical or Abbreviated Language, with
 an Application to Mathematical Probability,
 pp. 91–92

[Question No.] 5339, p. 92
 [Question No.] 5373, pp. 123–124
 [Question No.] 5402, p. 147
 Solution [to Question 5281], p. 171
 [Question No.] 5450, p. 173
 Symbolical Language—No.2, p. 195
 [Question No.] 5469, p. 196
 [Question No.] 5511, p. 221
 Solution [to Question 5155], p. 300
 [Question No.] 5231, p. 302

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 9

The Calculus of Equivalent Statements and
 Integration Limits
 The Calculus of Equivalent Statements (II),
 pp. 177–186

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 27

Solution [to Question No. 5155], p. 66
 Solution [to Question No. 5213], p. 84
 [Question No.] 5231, p. 85

1878

The Educational Times, vol. 31

[Question No.] 5584, p. 89
 [Question No.] 5645, p. 138
 [Question No.] 5808, p. 294

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 10

The Calculus of Equivalent Statements (III),
 pp. 16–28

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 28

Symbolical or Abbreviated Language, with
 an Application to Mathematical Probability,
 pp. 20–23
 Symbolical Language:—No. 2, p. 100

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 29

[Question No.] 5339, p. 66
 Solution [to Question No. 5339], pp. 66–68

1879

The Educational Times, vol. 32

- [Question No.] 5861, p. 22
 [Question No.] 6107, p. 292
 [Question No.] 6133, p. 317
 [Question No.] 6173, p. 341
Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 11
 The Calculus of Equivalent Statements (IV), pp. 113–121
Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 12
 A note on Prof. C. S. Peirce's probability notation of 1867, p. 102
Educational Times Reprints, vol. 30
 [Question No.] 5450, p. 50
 [Question No.] 5511, p. 78
 Solution [to Question No. 5511], pp. 79–80
Educational Times Reprints, vol. 31
 [Question No.] 5861, p. 43
 Solution [to Question No. 5861], pp. 43–44
- ## 1880
- Letters to W. S. Jevons*
 August 18th 1880. [Encl. copy of letter to the *Phil. Mag.*, entitled] Symbolic Logic
The Educational Times, vol. 33
 [Question No.] 6133, pp. 21–22
 Solution [to Question No. 6133], pp. 21–22
 [Question No.] 6206, p. 23
 [Question No.] 6235, p. 68
 [Question No.] 6258, p. 97
 Arithmetical Notation. To the Editor of the *Educational Times*, p. 111
 [Question No.] 6330, p. 144
 [Question No.] 6173, p. 214
 Solution [to Question No. 6353], p. 237
 [Question No.] 6461, p. 239
 Solution [to Question No. 6235], p. 262
 [Question No.] 6525, p. 289
London, Edinburgh, and Dublin Phil. Mag. and J. of Science, vol. 10
- On the Diagrammatic and Mechanical Representation of Propositions and Reasonings, pp. 168–171
London, Edinburgh, and Dublin Phil. Mag. and J. of Science, vol. 11
 Implication and Equational Logic, pp. 40–43
Mind, n.s., vol. 5
 Symbolic[al] Reasoning (I), pp. 45–60
Educational Times Reprints, vol. 33
 Problem Nr. ?, pp. 22–24
- ## 1881
- Letters to W. S. Jevons*
 May 27th 1881
The Educational Times, vol. 34
 Solution [to Question No. 6485], p. 22
 Solution [to Question No. 6560], p. 22
 [Question No.] 6575, p. 24
 [Question No.] 6615, p. 75
 Solution [to Question No. 6574], pp. 146–147
Proc. Manchester Lit. and Phil. Soc., vol. 20
 On the Growth and Use of a Symbolical Language, p. 103
Educational Times Reprints, vol. 34
 Solution [to Question No. 6383], p. 36
 [Question No.] 6173, p. 40
 Solution [to Question No. 6353], p. 51
 [Question No.] 6235, p. 69
 Solution [to Question No. 6235], p. 69
 [Question No.] 6461, p. 85
- ## 1882
- The Educational Times*, vol. 35
 On Probability and Listerism, p. 103
 On Probability and Listerism. No.2., p. 127
 Solution [to Question No. 5397], p. 128
Memoirs Manchester Lit. and Phil. Soc., vol. 7

On the Growth and Use of a Symbolical Language, pp. 225–248

1883

Letters to C. S. Peirce

May 16th 1883

1884

The Educational Times, vol. 37

To the Editor of the Educational Times, p. 201

To the Editor of the Educational Times, pp. 231–232

[Question No.] 7871, p. 330

[Question No.] 7897, p. 356

Solution [to Question No. 7849], p. 385

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 16

On the Limits of Multiple Integrals, pp. 142–148

1885

The Educational Times, vol. 38

[Question No.] 7983, p. 30

[Question No.] 8026, p. 69

[Question No.] 8093, p. 160

[Question No.] 8286, p. 350

[Question No.] 8387, p. 412

1886

The Educational Times, vol. 39

Solution [to Question No. 8387], p. 134

1887

Letters to C. S. Peirce

le 17 Août 1887

1888

The Educational Times, vol. 41

[Questions No.] 1898 & 4043, p. 134

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 20

A New Angular Trigonometrical Notation, with Applications, read 14. 03. 1889, not printed, p. 180

1889

Mr. Stranger's Sealed Packet, Chatto & Windus, London

The Educational Times, vol. 42

[Question No.] 10119, p. 223

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 51

[Question No.] 3646, p. 130

[Question No.] 4043, pp. 135–136

1890

The Educational Times, vol. 44

[Question No.] 10619, p. 268

[Question No.] 10708, p. 404

[Question No.] 10750, p. 446

[Question No.] 10780, p. 485

[Question No.] 10814, p. 529

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 52

[Question No.] 9996, pp. 33–34

[Question No.] 10119, pp. 37–38

Solution [to Question No.] 10274, pp. 103–104

[Question No.] 4155, pp. 133–134

1891

Ednor Whitlock, Chatto & Windus, London

The Educational Times, vol. 44

[Question No.] 10937, p. 157

[Question No.] 11017, p. 239

[Question No.] 11061, p. 275

[Question No.] 11104, p. 307

Solution [to Question No. 11061], p. 343

[Question No.] 11186, p. 345

[Question No.] 11235, p. 411

[Question No.] 11104, p. 527

Solution [to Question No. 11104], p. 527

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 55

[Question No.] 5469, p. 136

[Question No.] 10536, p. 180

1892

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 56

[Question No.] 11061, pp. 51–54

[Question No.] 10750, pp. 89–90

[Question No.] 11104, pp. 115–116

[Question No.] 6107, p. 134

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 57

[Question No.] 11186, p. 38

1893

The Educational Times, vol. 46

[Question No.] 7937a, p. 303

[Question No.] 7937b, pp. 303–304

1894

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 61

[Question No.] 3646, pp. 68–69

1895

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 62

[Question No.] 3464, p. 122

[Question No.] 3552, p. 125

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 63

[Question No.] 3771, p. 124

1896

The Educational Times, vol. 49

[Question No.] 13234, p. 396

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 28

The Calculus of Equivalent Statements (V),
pp. 156–183

The Calculus of Equivalent Statements (VI),
pp. 555–579

1897

Mind, n.s., vol. 6

Symbolic[al] Reasoning (II), pp. 493–510

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 29

The Calculus of Equivalent Statements
(VII), pp. 98–109

The Calculus of Equivalent Statements
(VIII) (communicated in abstract
09.06.1898, not printed), p. 545

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 66

[Question No.] 13234, pp. 95–97

[Question No.] 13288, pp. 119–120

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 67

[Question No.] 5318, p. 125

1898

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 30

The Calculus of Equivalent Statements.
Explanatory Note and Correction, pp.
330–332

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 68

[Question No.] 13449, pp. 30–31

Solution [to Question No.] 13517, p. 68

[Question No.] 13517, p. 68

[Question No.] 5584, p. 123

[Question No.] 5645, p. 124

1899

Mind, n.s., vol. 8

Review of “A Treatise on Universal Algebra
with Applications, Vol. 1. By Alfred North
Whitehead, M. A., Fellow and Lecturer of
Trinity College, Cambridge, Cambridge
University Press, 1898, Pp. 586”, pp. 108–113

Educational Times Reprints, vol. 71

[Question No.] 14030, p. 31

[Question No.] 5645, pp. 118–119

1900

The Educational Times, vol. 53

[Question No.] 14439, p. 37

Solution [to Question No. 6330], p. 82

[Question No.] 14469, p. 83

[Question No.] 14498, p. 149
 [Question No.] 14557, p. 225
 Solution [to Question No. 14122], p. 258
 Solution [to Question No. 14394], pp. 377–378
 [Question No.] 14665, p. 380
 [Question No.] 14721, p. 463
 [Question No.] 14751, p. 503

Mind, n.s., vol. 9

Symbolic[al] Reasoning (III), pp. 75–84
 [Note:] “I should be glad to have the opinions of logicians ...”, p. 144

1901

Letters to B. Russell

28. VI. 1901
 19. VII. 1901
 10. IX. 1901
 11. IX. 1901
 6. X. 1901

Bibliothèque du I^{er} Congrès International de Philosophie. Logique et Histoire des Sciences

La Logique Symbolique et ses Applications, pp. 135–183

The Educational Times, vol. 54

[Question No.] 14781, p. 36
 [Question No.] 14807, p. 84
 [Question No.] 14828, p. 154
 [Question No.] 14853, p. 191
 Solution [to Question No. 14375], p. 500
 [Question No.] 15024, p. 502

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 34

Limits of Logical Statements
 (communicated by reading the title 14. 11. 1901, not printed), p. 132

1902

Mathematical Questions and Solutions from the "Educational Times" with Many Papers and Solutions in Addition to Those Published in the "Educational Times". New Series., Francis Hodgson, London

The Educational Times, vol. 55

Solution [to Question No. 14751], pp. 37–38
 [Question No.] 8093, p. 40
 Solution [to Question No. 14665], p. 155
 [Question No.] 15064, p. 157
 [Question No.] 15085, p. 197
 Erratum, p. 198
 [Question No.] 15206, p. 437

Mind, n.s., vol. 11

Symbolic[al] Reasoning (IV), pp. 352–368

Proc. London Math. Soc., vol. 35

On the Validity of Certain Formulae
 (communicated from the Chair 16. 04. 1903, not printed), p. 459

Revue de Métaphysique et de Morale, vol. 10

Logique tabulaire, pp. 213–217

Educational Times Reprints, n.s., vol. 1

[Question No.] 14807, p. 76
 [Question No.] 14781, p. 81
 Solution [to Question No. 14781], pp. 81–82
 Solution [to Question No. 14786], p. 88
 [Question No.] 14853, p. 97
 Solution [to Question No. 14853], pp. 97–98
 [Question No.] 14375, p. 111
 Solution [to Question No. 14375], pp. 111–113

Educational Times Reprints, n.s., vol. 2

[Question No.] 14751, p. 29
 Solution [to Question No. 14751], pp. 29–30

1903

The Athenaeum

Symbolic Logic, p. 137
 Symbolic Logic II, pp. 321–322
 Symbolic Logic III, pp. 354–355
 Symbolic Logic, p. 385

L'Enseignement Mathématique, vol. 5

La logique symbolique, pp. 415–430

L'Enseignement Mathématique, vol. 6

La logique symbolique (II), pp. 372–375

The Educational Times, vol. 56

Solution [to Question No. 15206], pp. 90–91

[Question No.] 15299, p. 157

[Question No.] 15429, p. 441

Mind, n.s., vol. 12

Symbolic[al] Reasoning (V), pp. 355–364

Educational Times Reprints, n.s., vol. 4

Paradoxes in Symbolic Logic, pp. 34–36

[Question No.] 15206, pp. 47–48

Solution [to Question No. 15206], p. 48

1904

Letters to B. Russell

26. VIII. 1904

The Athenaeum

Symbolic Logic. A Correction

Symbolic Logic, pp. 13–16

Symbolic Logic VI, pp. 149–151

Symbolic Logic VII, pp. 213–214

Symbolic Logic IV, pp. 244–245

Symbolic Logic V, pp. 468–469

Symbolic Logic VIII, pp. 879–880

Symbolic Logic IX, p. 911

The Educational Times, vol. 57

Solution [to Question No. 15429], pp.

159–160

[Question No.] 15588, p. 313

[Question No.] 10050 [Old Questions as Yet Unsolved (in our Columns)], p. 450

Educational Times Reprints, n.s., vol. 5

The Calculus of Limits, pp. 66–70

Educational Times Reprints, n.s., vol. 6

[Question No.] 15429, p. 58

Solution [to Question No. 15429], pp. 58–59

1905

Letters to B. Russell

26. I. 1905

03. II. 1905

03. III. 1905

05. IV. 1905

03. V. 1905

10. V. 1905

15. V. 1905

16. V. 1905

17. V. 1905

28. V. 1905

29. VI. 1905

22. VII. 1905

The Educational Times, vol. 58

[Question No.] 7983 [Old Questions as Yet Unsolved (in our Columns)], p. 494

[Question No.] 10780 [Old Questions as Yet Unsolved (in our Columns)], p. 534

Mind, n.s., vol. 14

Symbolic[al] Reasoning (VI), pp. 74–81

Existential Import, pp. 295–296

Symbolic[al] Reasoning (VII), pp. 390–397

The Existential Import of Propositions [A Reply to Bertrand Russell], pp. 401–402

The Existential Import of Propositions, pp. 578–579

1906

Symbolic Logic and its Applications, Longmans, Green and Co., London

Letters to B. Russell

24. II. 1906

05. III. 1906

12. III. 1906

02. IV. 1906

The Educational Times, vol. 59

Solution [to Question No. 15957], pp. 267–268

[Question No.] 16059, p. 413

[Question No.] 16059, p. 413

Solution [to Question No. 16059], p. 493

- [Question No.] 11285 [Old Questions as Yet Unsolved (in our Columns)], p. 540
The Hibbert Journal, vol. 5
 Chance or Purpose, pp. 384–396
Mind, n.s., vol. 15
 Symbolic Reasoning (VIII), pp. 504–518
- 1907**
Letters to B. Russell
 18. I. 1907
The Educational Times, vol. 59
 [Question No.] 10708, p. 82
 [Question No.] 16292, p. 458
 Solution [to Question No. 16292], p. 544
The Hibbert Journal, vol. 6
 What and Where is the Soul?, pp. 158–170
Mind, n.s., vol. 16
 Symbolic Logic. A reply, pp. 470–473
- 1908**
The Hibbert Journal, vol. 6
 What and Where is the Soul?, pp. 673–674
Mind, n.s., vol. 17
 ‘If’ and ‘Imply’, pp. 151–152
 ‘If’ and ‘Imply’, pp. 453–455
- 1909**
Man’s Origin, Destiny and Duty, Williams and Norgate, London
Letters to B. Russell
 04. X. 1909
 18. XII. 1909
The Educational Times, vol. 62
 [Question No.] 16734, p. 429
The Hibbert Journal, vol. 7
 Mathematics and Theology, pp. 916–918
The Hibbert Journal, vol. 8
- Ptolemaic and Copernian Views of the Place of Mind in the Universe (II), pp. 429–430
- 1910**
The Educational Times, vol. 63
 Solution [to Question No. 16751], p. 35
 [Question No.] 16788, p. 37
Mind, n.s., vol. 19
 Linguistic Misunderstandings (I), pp. 186–199
 Linguistic Misunderstandings (II), pp. 337–355
- 1911**
The Educational Times, vol. 64
 [Question No.] 12359 [Old Questions as Yet Unsolved (in our Columns)], p. 138
- 1973**
Lackey, D. (ed.): Essays in Analysis, George Allen and Unwin Ltd., London
 Symbolic Reasoning (VI), pp. 308–316
 Existential Import, p. 317
 The Existential Import of Propositions (A Reply to Chapter 4 above), pp. 317–319
 The Existential Import of Propositions, pp. 319–322