



嘉宾：海蒂·哈根 (Heidi Østbø Haugen)，人文地理学博士，挪威奥斯陆大学东方语言与文化研究系教授，欧洲研究委员会基金《户牖往来：中国外向型发展研究》项目主持人

采访：张亦弛，奥斯陆大学东方语言与文化研究系博士后研究员

A Transnational Perspective on Urban Developments in the Greater Bay Area 跨国视野下的大湾区城市建设

HH=海蒂·哈根 YC=张亦弛

YC: You got an ERC project, the highest-level research project in Europe to study transnational connections from the Pearl River Delta. Could you please briefly introduce the project?

您正在主持欧洲最高级别的研究项目——欧洲研究委员会基金 (ERC) ——以研究珠三角地区的跨国联系。您可否简要介绍一下该项目？

HH: Chinese global engagements are deepening across sectors and geographic regions. I wanted to research the specific ways in which China's extraversion advances, and this was my motivation in devising the project *Brokering China's Extraversion: An Ethnographic Analysis of Local-Global Arbitration* (BROKEX for short). The project is funded by the European Research Council (ERC), and takes an original approach to this question by examining brokers who mediate

within transnational fields.

中国的外向型发展正延伸至世界的各个方面和每个角落。我对其具体的发展方式非常感兴趣，这也是提出《户牖往来：中国外向型发展研究》项目（简称《户牖往来》）的原因。该项目由欧洲研究委员会（ERC）资助，旨在通过原创的方法考察跨国领域间发挥调停作用的中介。

I applied for funding for this endeavor through the ERC because they fund large-scale frontier research for scholars based in the European Union. The ERC funding is granted based on scientific excellence alone, leaving it to the researchers to identify research objectives and methods. This freedom is the dream of any researcher, but I believe that it's particularly important to fund curiosity driven projects about China at a time when geopolitical fault lines regrettably become more pronounced and influence all policy agendas, including in research.

我申请欧洲研究委员会基金的原因在于它是欧盟内支持大规模前沿研究的基金。在资助方面，该基金仅以科研水平作为唯一依据，并由科研人员自行确定研究目标和方法。这对于任何科研人员来说都无疑是梦寐以求的。尤其是在地缘政治政策导向，包括科研政策，日趋明显的今天，这些对于中国议题的资助更显得弥足珍贵。

My disciplinary background is in human geography, and I have been interested in how human relations stretch out across space and in how different places are connected. There are few places in the world that are better suited than the Pearl River Delta for such a study because of the intensity and variety of transnational connections from this region. In the years before the ERC project, I studied how people, money, ideas, and goods circulate between the Pearl River Delta and West Africa. I followed consumer goods through various phases in the value chain—design, manufacturing, wholesale, transport, import, and retail. In doing so, I was able to draw

connections between events in different parts of the world and see how actors shaped these events. Mapping these linkages required painstaking work, but the efforts worthwhile when they yielded insights into how particular connections were made through specific places. I wanted to extend this approach to new thematic fields, while retaining the focus on Pearl River Delta. The size of an ERC grant allowed me to recruit a multidisciplinary team of researchers who could understand various kinds of transnational connections from the Pearl River Delta.

我是人文地理学背景出身，一直关注于人际关系在各类空间中的延伸和不同场所间的联系。珠三角地区紧密而多样的跨国联系无疑为我们的研究提供了最好的素材。在主持本欧洲研究委员会项目目前的数年间，我一直考察人员、资金、思想和货物等在珠三角与西非间的流动。我从设计、制造、批发、运输、进口和零售等环节入手追踪消费价值链，串联世界各地间不同的事件，分析各要素是如何塑造了相关事件。研究联系的过程虽然不易，但通过这些探讨却使我们意识到联系的纽带是如何将特定地点串在一起的。在关注珠三角的同时，我也努力将该方法延伸至新的研究领域。借由欧洲研究委员会基金的资助，我组建了一支跨学科的研究团队，以期从不同视角出发理解珠三角的跨国联系。

YC: You said that the ERC supports ‘frontier research’. What is novel about Brokex?

您说欧洲研究委员会基金旨在支持“前沿研究”，《户牖往来》都有哪些创新之处？

HH: China’s global connections have been subject to quite a lot of academic scrutiny in the past. Many studies have focused on the factors that motivate global connections, for example how high labor supply have resulted in outsourcing to China, the ways capital surplus have driven Chinese investments abroad, and a quest for international recognition as a motivating factor for Chinese international ventures. We also know a lot about the outcomes of these engagements, for example in the form of increased foreign direct investments, growth in exports, and diplomatic achievements.

中国的全球联系已引起了学界广泛的关注。很多研究都聚焦于全球联系的动因上，如高劳动力供给是如何推动中国的外包产业，资本盈余是如何促进中国的海外投资，国际声誉又是如何影响中国的国际融资等。此外，学者们还针对外国直接投资增加、出口增长和外交成就等问题展开了一系列研究。

The novelty of Brokex is that we focus on the processes between these end-points the specific ways that incentives are translated into concrete transnational linkages or fail to produce such results. We aim to generate knowledge about how China’s global connections advance. Our lens for exploring this is brokerage. We examine the role of brokers, widely understood, in forging connections across scales and territories.

相较而言，《户牖往来》更侧重于检视这些节点间的联系过程，即动因是如何成功或失败地转化为跨国联系，继而导致各类结果。通过“中介”视角，我们旨在考察中国全球联系的推动方式，和中介在不同尺度与地域间的连结作用。

YC: What can brokerage offer urban studies?

中介理论能为城市研究提供什么？

HH: The idea that some people and organizations are well-positioned to shape how groups interact is an old one in the social sciences. More than a hundred years ago, the sociologist Georg Simmel proposed that actors positioned between groups

so-called ‘third elements’ have the power to change the dynamics of interaction. The third actor can take on different roles: They may be interested in strengthening the union between parties and settle conflicts. Or they can aim to retain the position in the middle to continue to benefit from it. Some third parties have an interest in following a ‘divide and rule’ approach. Current social network analysis builds on and further develop these ideas. For example, Granovetter in *The strength of weak ties* (1973) posited that connections offering represent the only route along which information and influence flow between groups—termed ‘bridges’—are crucial for linking social networks as well as to bring benefits to the actor in the middle. How to achieve the desired social connectivity is also a recurring theme in social science theory from China, from Fei Xiaotong’s *From the Soil* (1947) until today.

社会科学一直热衷于探讨不同人和组织间如何进行互动。一百余年前，社会学家格奥尔格·齐美尔 (Georg Simmel) 就指出，群体间存在着一个改变互动关系的行动者，即“第三要素”。该要素具有多重功效：可以强化联系调和矛盾，可以保持中立借以渔利，也可以发

挥作用“分而治之”。现有的社会网络分析又以此为基础进行了深化。如马克·格兰诺维特在《弱关系的力量》（1973）中就强调链接是反映群体间信息和影响流动的唯一路径，即“桥梁”；其在联系社会网络和促进中介获利等方面都具有重要意义。而如何实现理想的社会连通则是从费孝通发表《乡土中国》（1947年）开始就萦绕于中国社会科学理论界的问题。

Urban studies scholarship often maps city networks. This can be done by identifying physical connections, such as data cables and transport infrastructure, or immaterial networks, like migration routes, financial links, and the trajectories along which cultural trends travel. Identifying connections between cities by placing the cities as nodes on a network helps us understand the nature of cities. It is hard to imagine urban studies without concepts such as Saskia Sassen's 'global city' or the scholarship on 'ethnic enclaves', which are essentially about how cities are connected to other parts of the world.

城市研究经常考察城市网络。这可以包括物理联系，如数据电缆、交通基础设施等，或非物质网络，如移民路线、金融联接等，以及文化迁徙轨迹。将城市作为网络节点对城市间联系进行考察则有利于我们了解城市的本质。我们很难想象，如果没有萨斯基亚·萨森的《全球城市》或《种族飞地》等将城市与世界其他地方联系起来的著作，城市研究将会怎样。

Brokerage, as we use it in our project, is a perspective rather than a theory. It is about understanding the world through studying how new connections are forged. It starts from identifying how some actors position themselves between two or more other parties who are separated socially and/or geographically. How do brokers come to occupy interstitial spaces that enable mediation? Next follows an inquiry into how brokers take advantage of their positions to actually engage in mediation. In Brokex, we are interested in such brokerage in spaces that span national boundaries – in transnational brokerage. Of course, brokerage can be adopted as a perspective for studying relations at lower spatial scales as well. The point is that a focus on brokerage encourages us to go beyond documenting connections towards looking at how these connections come about.

在我们的项目中，“中介”是一种观点，而非理论。借由检视新连接的建立，它为我们提供了一种理解世界的方式。其出发点在于确定行为者是如何在不同社会或地理维度内进行自我定位，继而探讨中介是如何借机上位，最后则考察这些中介是如何依靠位置进行调停。在《户牖往来》项目中，我们旨在考察那些跨越国际边界的跨国中介活动。当然，我们也可以运用中介视角检视较低空间范畴内的关系。但其关键点都在于走出对联系的描述，转而关注联系的产生历程。

YC: Brokex is an interdisciplinary project. How do you integrate different disciplinary perspectives to study the Greater Bay Area?

《户牖往来》是一个跨学科项目。您是如何综合运用不同学科视角研究大湾区的？

HH: Interdisciplinarity came very naturally in this project. For example, Guangzhou has been a trading hub for centuries, and this history shapes its current place in the world. To understand how, we needed to include an economic history component in Brokex. And the economic upgrading of the region from being a site of labor intensive manufacturing

industries to attract globally mobile technology-intensive companies requires a different set of resources. China's extraversion is diverse, both in its logics and its consequences. Interdisciplinarity was necessary for capturing this diversity.

就本项目而言，跨学科是件非常自然的事情。如广州作为贸易中心已有几百年历史，这也促成了其在当下的国际地位。因此，我们必须将经济史的视角纳入《户牖往来》的研究范畴。而随着该区域的经济模式从劳动密集型制造业升级为集聚全球菁英的技术密集型企业，其也需要不同的资源配置。所以，中国的外向性发展无论在逻辑还是在结果上都具有多样性的特征。正因如此，我们也必须采用跨学科的方法对其进行探讨。

The concept of brokerage helps keep the project together in spite of the differences between the disciplines that the researchers in Brokex represent. It unites us in the perspective we apply in our respective fields. Beodex is not a comparative project in the traditional sense, we do not seek out similarities and differences across contexts. Instead, we apply different disciplinary perspectives in several studies of processes of extraversion unfold within one region. When individual studies raise questions, we bring these questions to other case studies to identify

crosscutting analytical concerns. Transnational connections take on different expressions in each of the case studies. This helps bring the dynamics of brokerage to the fore and supports a conceptually oriented analysis. We are still collecting and analyzing empirical data and are very much immersed in the various case studies, but the aim is to eventually use the combination of cases as a foundation for critical theorization about brokerage.

虽然研究人员的学科背景各有不同，但中介这一共通视角却将他们与《户牖往来》项目连接起来。这并非一个传统意义上的比较项目，我们也不关注文本内的异同。反之，我们力图通过结合不同学科视角考察一个地区的外向性发展过程。当我们在某一个个案发现问题后，我们便将该问题代入到其他个案中类比分析。虽然每个个案中跨国联系的表现形式各不相同，但归纳综合后却可以展示中介的多重动态，进而在此基础上展开概念分析。我们致力于收集分析田野资料，考察研讨各类案例，以期批判性地扩展中介理论。

YC: What is the difference to study from a transnational perspective by comparing it from a local perspective? What is the value of a transnational perspective in urban research?

跨国视角与本土视角有何不同？运用跨国视角进行城市研究的价值又在哪里？

HH: Transnational perspectives deliberately displaces the nation-state as the given scale of analysis. In transnational research, one often opts to leave the question of scale open to investigation rather than deciding in ahead of the study. This does not mean that the nation is irrelevant. Research on informal cross border trade, for example, documents how the existence of national borders creates opportunities for making

profit for those who are able to navigate them. Similarly, scholarship on transnational migration has started to explore the forms of infrastructure that facilitate the mobility of people across borders. Transnational connections are always localized: They span places with specific economic, social, and political circumstances. Those who operate in transnational space have to handle several set of circumstances. Scholarship on transnationalism highlights the added embeddedness that comes with lives across international borders. This may bring more opportunities and choices, but it may also create encumbrances.

跨国视角正日渐取代民族国家这一既定的分析范畴。在跨国研究中，人们不再于研究前对范畴自我设限，而是将其留待研究过程中逐步解决。这并不意味着与国家无关。如，非正式跨境贸易的研究让我们知道跨境者是如何利用国家边界创造财富；而跨国移民的研究也让我们了解到不同类型的基础设施又是如何影响人们的跨国流动。跨国联系往往立足本土，横跨多类经济、社会与政治环境。这也要求参与跨国活动的人必须对相关环境了如指掌。跨国研究强调因跨越国家边际边界而带来的嵌入性。其在带来更多机会、选择的同时，也制造了麻烦。

Urban research is well-suited for elucidating the material infrastructure that promotes or results from the transnational organization of social life. A case in point is the incubators set up in and around Shenzhen for start-up companies in high-tech industries. Brokex studies how the aspirations and everyday experiences of founders in globally oriented start-ups are shaped by the environment in Shenzhen. One team member was embedded in several companies and incubators around Shenzhen for weeks at the time. The entrepreneurs, whether Chinese or foreign, aim to eventually serve a global market and are in theory able to set up in globally oriented innovation areas in other parts of the world. Their outlook is global, but their lives are also very influenced by the features particular to the Shenzhen environment, such as the value placed on speed and on bracketing connections to family while enduring the current existence.

城市研究非常适用于分析那些因跨国生活而出现的基础设施。其中一个典型案例就是深圳及其周边的高科技产业创业公司孵化器。《户牖往来》项目旨在探讨深圳的环境是如何模塑出这些目光远大、放眼世界公司创始人的野望与生活。我们的项目组成员深入考察了多家深圳公司与孵化器。然而无论是中资还是外资企业，虽然其均视服务全球市场，开拓国际创新为己任，但在日常生活中，却又不得不受到深圳特殊环境的制约，如对速度的追求和家庭工作平衡的维系。

Another type of infrastructure that enables a transnational orientation are international schools. These schools were originally established in the Pearl River Delta to enable globally mobile specialized technical personnel, managers, and investors to move to the region with their families. However, Chinese children who have never lived overseas make up a growing share of the student body at the international schools in the Greater Bay Area. Elite families without

a background of living abroad choose international schools for their pedagogically liberal and cosmopolitan education, as well as to hedge against risks. Surging demand for pre-university international education in the Greater Bay Area has led to the establishment of dozens of new schools, first in the economic power houses of Guangzhou and Shenzhen, and more recently in second-tier cities and suburbs. The schools still represent an expression of transnational orientation, but one that is different from the early years of reform and opening up.

国际学校是另一种跨国导向的基础设施。在珠三角设立这些学校的最初目的是为了更方便国际专业技术人员、管理人员和投资者及其家人来此定居。但在大湾区国际学校学生群体中，那些不具有海外背景的中国学生比例却越来越高。缺少海外背景的精英家庭正力图通过选读国际学校的方式获取国际通识教育。教育需求的激增也促使大湾区内涌现出数十座新的国际学校：先在广、深等经济重镇，继而推广至二线城市和郊县地区。虽然这些学校始终以跨国为导向，但其与改革开放初期相比却已大为不同。

YC: The research project was designed to be based on ethnographic fieldwork and local archival sources in the Greater Bay Area. How was your research affected when global travel became more difficult after 2020?

该研究项目主要以田野调查为基础。随着2020年后全球旅行日益困难，您的研究都受到哪些影响？

HH: The case studies of transnational connections in Brokex have had to change quite a lot. Some of these changes are a normal part of the research process, such as adjusting to the background and interests of the junior researchers. However, the changes had to much more wide-ranging than anticipated when we found ourselves in a situation where most of the researchers could not travel to the Greater Bay Area due to the global situation since early 2020. We have shifted both

the ethnographic fieldwork and the research in archives to sites that are accessible to us today. We have also been able to do some interviews remotely via Zoom. Finally, we have relied more on textual material than we originally anticipated.

《户牖往来》项目对其跨国联系部分进行了一系列调整。一些是研究过程中较为常见的，如根据青年学者的背景和研究兴趣展开微调；但另一些因为旅行原因而产生的变化则是始料未及的。为此，我们不得不改变田野战略，转至方便田野的地方调研，并运用Zoom远程访谈作为辅助手段。此外，与原计划相比，我们也更依赖于文本材料进行研究。

My own data collection focuses on the section of the economy that the Greater Bay Area aspires to move away from: informally organized labor-intensive low-value manufacturing. Such industries still remain the economic backbone in many localities in Pearl River Delta. The Chinese producers rely on agents to connect with prospective customers and get information about tastes, purchasing power, and legal practices at end markets. Over the past decade, brokerage in China-Africa exports has become professionalized, and informal brokers have responded to threats of value chain ejections by expanding the range of their services. My research was initially set to examine how brokers try to retain strategic positions in China-Africa trade in response to business evolutions that threaten to make them redundant. The trading agents as well as the African traders themselves face the same problem as researchers these days: They cannot travel between China and Africa like they did before. I usually do my fieldwork in trading malls, factories, warehouses, exhibition halls, and container ports in Pearl River Delta, the same places the African traders and their Chinese counterparts work. Now that I have not been able to travel to China, I have shifted my fieldwork to the African sites in which the goods arrive. My research is still focused around brokerage, but with a new angle: How are connections retained when physical travels are no longer possible? And how do people maintain trust in an exceptionally volatile market? I too have limited information when I cannot travel to China, and I incorporate my experiences with these limitations into my methodological approach.

我的田野工作主要集中于大湾区亟需剥离的经济产业，即非正式劳动密集型低端制造业。在珠三角很多地区，该产业都发挥着经济支柱作用。中国厂商通过中介与潜在客户建立联系，获取品类、购买力和法律行为等终端市场信息。中非出口的中介业务已在过去的十年间实现了专业化发展，这也促使非正式中介不得不通过扩大服务范畴的方式应对来自于价值链的威胁。我本打算研究中非贸易商业发展的背景下的中介是如何采取战略措施缓解其不利局面。但和我们研究人员一样，贸易代理人 and 非洲商人近来也在中非旅行方面面临着种种问题。一般而言，我倾向在珠三角的贸易商场、工厂、仓库、展会、港口等非洲商人及其中国同事的工作场所进行考察。但现在，我只得将田野地由货物的出发地——中国转入货物的抵达

地——非洲。虽然我的研究始终围绕中介展开，但我在其中也尝试引入新视角，即人们是如何在旅行不便的情况下保持联络？又是如何在市场动荡的背景下坚守信任？虽然旅行变化对我的研究造成了一定冲击，但我却通过个人经验将这些变化纳入到我的研究中。

YC: What about the other parts of Brokex, how have they been adjusted to the current situation?

《户牖往来》项目的其他成员如何？他们都进行了哪些调整应对？

HH: One work package uses archival records to explore the business model of conglomerates through two case studies within and beyond the Chinese paradigm. The first of these is Tongshuntai, which was a Chinese diasporic company based on the Korean peninsula from the late nineteenth to the early twentieth century, regarded as the prototype of Japanese

zaibatsus and Korean chaebols—the key engines of economic growth in modern East Asia. The other company studied is a British multinational enterprise, the Swire Group. We originally planned to do archival studies in Guangzhou, but was able to move the data collection to the UK and carry out some of it remotely. We use the newly published business documents of Tongshuntai held at the Seoul National University and the Swire collection held at the School of Asian and African Studies in London SOAS to investigate their ways of management and their access to local capital to become independent from colonial trade and diversify their business. In addition, we refer to the East India Company, Foreign and Colonial Office Records held at the British Library and the National Archives to develop a broader historical context. With these sources, we can identify common business practices of conglomeration across regional and ethnic boundaries. Ultimately, the aim of this work package is to challenge culturally essentialist interpretations of business models and revisit Chandler's theory of modern business management and state bureaucracy.

本项目一个方向是借由历史资料考察中国企业的两种商业范式。第一个是同顺泰，一个在19、20世纪之交出现于朝鲜半岛的中资企业。作为日本和韩国财团的原型，其对东亚经济的现代化发展具有重要推动作用。另一家则是英资跨国公司——太古集团。我们原打算在广州查阅档案，但最后则不得不将田野工作转至英国，并运用远程方式作为补充。通过考察首尔大学新近出版的同顺泰商业资料和伦敦亚非学院保存的太古馆藏，我们检视了这些企业是如何通过联结本地资本的手段达到脱离殖民贸易和丰富业务种类的目的。此外，我们还利用大英图书馆和国家档案馆的东印度公司馆藏资料和外国殖民地办公室的相关记录构筑出更广阔的历史背景。在此基础上，我们勾勒出跨地域、民族商团所共通的经营模式，进而从文化视角出发对商业模式的本质主义阐释进行批判，并对钱德勒的现代商业管理和国家官僚机构理论加以反思。

Finally, Brokex has a work package on transnational architectural production in the Greater Bay Area. The work package emphasizes the symbolic and spatial dimension of local-global brokerage. Initially, we intended to study how international architecture firms bring Western architectural expressions and prestige to Chinese context, while negotiating the terms under which they work with local planners. Without the possibility to do fieldwork, we turned out focus to how urban planning ideas have travelled out of and into the Greater Bay area, historically and today.

此外，《户牖往来》项目还考察大湾区的跨国建筑生产。该方向旨在从抽象和空间层面出发考察全球交流。我们本打算探讨国际建筑公司是如何通过与本土规划师的互动将西方的建筑形式与声名威望引入中国。但在田野工作受限的情况下，我们只得将研究方向调整为考察城市规划理念是如何进入和走出昨天与今天的大湾区。

责任编辑：刘道然