Not everyone enjoys being loved, but I like it

A corpus-based comparative investigation of the translation paradigms and lexicogrammatical features of a selection of verbs denoting emotions in English and Norwegian.
Introduction

Research questions

1. What can the lexicogrammatical features and translation paradigms of three English-Norwegian verb pairs denoting feeling tell us about:
   a) The level of correspondence between the English and the Norwegian verbs in terms of meaning, usage and selectional preferences/collocations?
   b) The relationship between form and meaning in language construction?

2. Is there a systematic difference in how English native speakers and Norwegian learners use and understand these and semantically related verbs?
Selection of verbs

• *Enjoy, love* and *like* have overlapping meaning and connotations
  – interesting from L2 perspective and in terms of native usage.
• Can be measured for strength/intensity, belong to different ends of the scale.
• The 3 most frequent *admire verbs* (category by Beth Levin, 1993:191) in the BNC.
  – Transitive verbs with experiencer subject.
  – Boster 2005: Emotion includes evaluation/judgement.
    • Liable to subjective usage and cultural influence of learner language.
• Norwegian *nyte, elske* and *like* are listed as the first and foremost translation equivalent in most bilingual dictionaries on the market.
Material

- **ENPC**: Bidirectional translation, parallel. 50 texts in both directions, 2.6 mill. words.
- **LBK**: Norwegian native, 100 mill. words.
- **Steinerskolen-NO**: Norwegian native, upper secondary students, creative writing and argumentative essays.
- **ICLE-NO**: Norwegian learners, argumentative essays. Roughly 125,000 words (2 mill. total)
- **Steinerskolen–EN**: Norwegian learners, upper secondary students, creative writing and argumentative essays.
Material

- **MICUSP**: English native, 2.6 mill words in total. 127 papers in Creative writing + argumentative essay.
- **BNC**: English native. Written: 90 mill words. Imaginative genre: 476 texts, ca. 18 mill. words.
- **BAWE**: English native, undergraduate academic users. 1,4 mill words in texts from 1st year students.
- **Elicitation**: English native users and Norwegian learners. Content will be largely based on findings in corpus investigation.
Emotion research

- Monika Bednarek (2008)
  - Cross-linguistic approach
    - “the study of emotion terms across languages”
    - “seeks to demonstrate that the expression of emotions relies on culturally determined notions of emotions”.

- Fellbaum and Mathieu (2014)
  - Corpus-based construction of emotion verb scales: rating intensity.
Phraseology

• The study of the relationship between form and meaning

• Generative grammar and typically structuralism:
  – Grammar and meaning are independent of each other.
  – Grammar is the frame, words fit into their assigned lots.

• Sinclair: Idiom principle and open choice principle
  – Language is not memorised nor produced word-by-word, but as multi-word units.
  – Meaning and form are inseparable: lexicogrammar
  – What is considered the «core meaning» of a word is not typically the most frequent meaning in actual usage.
with Janet, after which it was agreed that the therapist would see her for the next 2 months at fortnightly intervals and that no
you. And I'd rather have the things I used to see than your phoney talk any day. V.H. Dear Dr Miller,

and Pradier's. I could see Mitterrand was widely interpreted at the conference

wasn't mine. We met at Pradier's. I could see the banality of that; though of course he couldn't.

any odds and ends it was better Brock at home did not see. Money was one. A woman was entitled to her own
drive B 3 Tap Enter Quitting Word 1 SAVE your work (see Task 4) 2 Tap Esc for Escape 3 Tap Q for

. Getting back to the Pompidou Centre, what changes will visitors see in the building itself? One purpose of the summer exhibition is

pivoting We now treat the same matrix by the third variant (see Table 3). For this example, this variant presents no

and glowered. He couldn't hear anything, but he could see his father covered in pollen and then he had watched the actress
drinkers, you could stand a spoon up in the fug. See that fire over there, by the bar counter? See the

that's ungrateful That's right then Why not? I'll see , no Anyway she's no money I know, well she

changes in March 1990 [see pp. 37319-20]; September [see p. 37714]; October [see p. 37779]; November

two or three lateen sails and triple banks of oars. I see the formidable galleasses of the Venetian Navy, built in the Arsenale

. Only rarely did the artist actually go to where he might see exotic species in the wild — and even if he had gone

to make sure that I didn't forget it. Oh I see what our Michael done? Put his shake thing in there spilt

? [unclear] if you like. No Albert'll be here. See . And as soon as I got home I wrote it down

. When she asked him if he would come with her to see Joanne he put forward the excuse of having his article to write

. Hearing the tramp of marching feet, he looked up to see Captain Warre riding at the head of his company. Climbing out

is not. Perhaps it is another. Let us go and see .” ‘So you walked out to the shoal and

visible have prospered. Nick Ross was a fellow protester. I see him now on Crimewatch. Anne Devlin another. She is a

the next fortnight, if you know that is. You should see people that think they got cameras out there they can't

see. Pascoe looked around the room as though he were checking to see whether he'd left anything behind. He said, ‘Lots
The Integrated Contrastive Model

- CA
  - OL vs OL: No (native) vs Eo (native)
  - SL vs TL: Eo/No and Nt/Et

- CIA
  - NL vs IL: NativeE vs NorE.
  - (IL vs. IL): Ger.E. vs Nor.E

Predictive
Transfer
Diagnostic
English-Norwegian contrastive analysis (CA)

A. Bidirectional translation in ENPC

– Translation paradigms of ENJOY, LOVE, LIKE
– Translation paradigms of NYTE, ELSKE, LIKE
– Correspondence between En-No, comparison of collocations/selectional preferences and meaning.
– Patterns with consistent meaning and/or translation into the other language?
English-Norwegian contrastive analysis (CA)

B. Comparable CA: Native use in BNC vs LBK and Steinerskolen-NO

- Phrasicon of more or less fixed phrases (idiomaticity)
- To what extent is the meaning a result of the phrase/context? Does form equal meaning, i.e. is the meaning of a particular pattern consistent?
- Do the English and Norwegian verbs have similar structural/collocational preferences?
- Compare with findings from ENPC.
The relationship between native and learner usage: CIA

• Do learners and natives use and understand the selected patterns similarly?
  • Steinerskolen-EN (AntConc), ICLE-NO vs BAWE, MICUSP and BNC.
    – Finding comparable parts of the corpora.
  • Elicitation
    • Rating emotional strength/intensity of verbs in context
    • Assigning connotations to verbs in context
    • Native-like selection – suitability in context
    • Include other semantically related verbs? Savour, indulge, adore, care about?
Table 1.1 Correspondences of ENJOY, simplified

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correspondences / Subcorp.</th>
<th>English original/ Norwegian tr</th>
<th>English trans./ Norwegian or.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fiction</td>
<td>Non-fiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIKE</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLEDE₁ [look forw. to or to please]</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sette pris på [appreciate]</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HYGGE₂ [what is done in snug inglenooks]</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ha [have]</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elske [love]</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zero correspondence</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYTE</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total hits ENJOY</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Contains several patterns with glede: *Glede seg* [look forward to], *ha glede av* [enjoy], *glede andre* [please others]
2 Contains several patterns with HYGGE(lig), both as verb, adjective and noun
Observations

• 18 out of 79 instances of ENJOY in original English texts were translated with NYTE, 18 with LIKE.

• In English translations, 15 out of 65 instances of ENJOY came from NYTE.

• 10 different core lexemes in translations from English + zero translation
  – *Enjoy* has a wider range of meaning and applications than *nyte*.
  – There is a relatively low mutual correspondence between the two lexemes in translations from English into Norwegian.
  – The meanings of *enjoy* may not be captured by a single lexeme in Norwegian.

• * Not all included in simplified table: quite a few translations with frequency of 1 or 2 removed
Observations

- *Nyte* and *sette pris på* [appreciate] are the most common translations of *enjoy* in Eo non-fiction, and *like* and *nyte* are the most frequent translations of *enjoy* in Eo fiction.
  - Not surprisingly, *enjoy* is used in a different sense in non-fiction than in fiction.
- Translations of *enjoy* into *elske* and *like* indicate overlapping meaning.
- Translations into Norwegian *ha* (have) indicate a strongly delexicalised usage of *enjoy* for certain contexts.
Table 1.2 Correspondences of NYTE, simplified

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text type</th>
<th>Norwegian orig/ English tr</th>
<th>Norwegian trans./ English orig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correspondences / subcorp.</td>
<td>Fiction</td>
<td>Non-fiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indulge</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Take advantage of</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Savour</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefit (from/NP/other)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zero correspondence</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENJOY</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total hits NYTE</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Observations

- 27 instances of *nyte* in Norwegian originals.
  - Far less frequent than *enjoy* (79)

- 6 different core lexemes + zero correspondence.
  - Less variation in English patterns in the translation from Norwegian into English than vice versa.
  - Supports notion that *nyte* has narrower meaning.

- Mutual correspondence:
  - \((18 +15) \times 100 / (79+27) = 21.6\%\)

- Translation bias:
  - \(18 \times 100/79 = 22.8\%\) for Eo-Nt and
  - \(15 \times 100/27 = 55.5\%\) for No-Et.
  - Also supports notion of *nyte* having a more restricted meaning

- Translations of *nyte* into *love* indicate overlapping meaning and stronger intensity than *enjoy*. 
When *enjoy* corresponds to *nyte*

1. [...] it occurred to him that she was just the sort of woman who would *enjoy* ten minutes' sex while changing for dinner, [...] (FW1)
2. “That’s why I never been no Christian — to me it means you can't *enjoy* life and since we only here once, that seems a shame." (GN1)
3. Basil stopped crying instantly in order to *enjoy* Ciel's punishment. (GN1)
4. He *enjoyed* the perquisites which went with first-class travel, even if today they seemed less significant than usual. (AH1)
5. The house next door to them had been empty for over a year so the Threadgolds had *enjoyed* the luxury of comparative privacy. (ST1)
Observations

- Relatively homogeneous group of examples: personal pronoun or proper noun is the subject of *enjoy/nyte*, what can be enjoyed is typically realised by NP.

- *Enjoy* means to *savour* or *indulge (in)* and has connotations of pleasure. Relatively high intensity?

- Examples 1, 2 and 3: connotations of sinfulness and guilty pleasure. Moral questionability?
When *enjoy* does not correspond to *nyte*

6. He had a tendency to *enjoy* these contacts with famous people,[...] *(ST1)*

*Han hadde en tendens til å *fryde seg* over* [be delighted by] *denne kontakten med tidens berømtheter,[...] *(ST1T)*

7. You will *enjoy* him. *(BC1)*

*De vil *ha glede av* [lit: have joy from] *å bli kjent med ham* [getting to know him]. *(BC1T)*

8. If he were, I would *enjoy* him less. *(MW1)*

*Hvis han hadde vært det, ville jeg *satt mindre pris på* [appreciated] ham. *(MW1T)*
When *enjoy* does not correspond to *nyte*

10. I think I *might enjoy* writing end-of-term reports for the stinkers in my class. *(RD1)*

    *Jeg tror faktisk jeg *ville likt* [would have liked] å skrive meldinger hjem til foreldrene ved skoleårets slutt.* *(RD1T)*

11. She *enjoyed* the irony of it all, [...].“ *(MW1)*

    *Hun *moret seg* nok *over* [had fun with/appreciated] *det ironiske ved hele greia*, [...]” *(MW1T)*
Observations

- The patterns in the examples where *enjoy* has not been translated into *nyte* are less homogeneous than in the congruent cases.
  - S-V-Noun, S-V-personal pronoun, S-V-ing participle clause, S-V-reflexive pronoun.
  - S-V-personal pronoun and S-V-reflexive pronoun, a translation with *nyte* might result in unidiomatic Norwegian:
    - You will enjoy him * Du vil nyte ham.
    - He’s really enjoying himself * Han nyter virkelig seg selv
- No connotations of pleasure, savouring or indulging:
  - *nyte* is not a likely choice
- Question: What else can be *enjoyed* that can’t be *nytt*?
Summing up

What can the lexicogrammatical features and translation paradigms of three English-Norwegian verb pairs denoting feeling tell us about:

a) The level of correspondence between the English and the Norwegian verbs in terms of meaning, usage and selectional preferences/collocations?

• *Enjoy* enjoys a wider range of applications and meanings than *nyte*, as well as a more flexible syntax.
• *Enjoy* seems to have a delexicalised usage which *nyte* does not.
• The two verbs have partially overlapping meaning, but seem to differ in terms of phraseology, collocation and colligation (to be investigated further in the BNC and LBK)

b) The relationship between form and meaning in language construction?

• What is considered the core meaning of a word is not necessarily the most frequent meaning in authentic usage.
• The meaning of a lexeme is largely derived from its collocations