Musical and Poetic Creativity for A Unique Moment in the Western Christian Liturgy, c.1000-1500

BENEDICAMUS

Proposal Summary:

BENEDICAMUS pursues a transformative focus on creative practices surrounding a particular moment in the Western Christian liturgy: the exclamation Benedicamus Domino (“Let us Bless the Lord”), which sounded in song several times a day from c.1000 to 1500. This moment was granted special musical licence c.1000: singers of plainchant melodies could choose to reprise a favourite tune from the Church music for the day, re-texting it with the words Benedictus Domino. In consequence, Benedictus Domino enjoyed unprecedented longevity and significance as a focus of compositional interest, prompting some of the earliest experiments in multi-voiced polyphonic composition c.1100, as well as a lasting tradition of popular, devotional carols in the 1300s and 1400s.

Histories of music have principally told the stories of particular composers, genres, institutions, or geographical centres. BENEDICAMUS undertakes the first longue durée study of musical and poetic responses to an exceptional liturgical moment, using this innovative perspective to work productively across established historiographical and disciplinary boundaries. Encompassing half a millennium of musical and ritual activity, hundreds of musical compositions, poetic texts, and manuscript sources, it offers pan-European perspectives on a chronologically and geographically diverse range of musical and poetic genres never before considered in conjunction. It develops new methods of music analysis to uncover traces of ad hoc or improvisatory performative practices that were not explicitly recorded in writing, forging interdisciplinary contexts for thinking about artistic creativity and experimentation in a time-period where these concepts have been little studied. BENEDICAMUS engages with the beginnings of musical and poetic genres and techniques that were crucial in shaping practices still current today, and reflects on music’s enduringly complex relationship with spirituality, ritual, and the sacred.
Research Questions and Objectives: BENEDICAMUS addresses the following principal research question and three sub-questions: How did a single moment in the Western Christian liturgy shape music history? (a) Why was the ritual exclamation Benedictamus Domino a moment of special musical freedom and experimentation in the period c.1000-1500? (b) What made melodies and poetic texts associated with Benedictamus Domino a locus of enduring and highly varied creative interest for more than five centuries? (c) How was Benedictamus Domino a catalyst for the development of new musico-poetic techniques and genres still current today? The project’s primary objective is to pursue a transformative focus on a particular moment in the Western Christian liturgy in three intersecting work packages. This moment has never before received sustained study, not because it is obscure or insignificant, but rather owing to its ubiquity—which is especially pronounced c.1000-1500—and inherent functional and musical flexibility. In eschewing established composer- or genre-centered approaches, BENEDICAMUS challenges these historiographical frameworks, better to reveal and accommodate the pluralities and complexities of musical, liturgical, and ritual practices pre 1500. Cutting across disciplinary boundaries between music and liturgy, and music and poetry, between the study of monophonic plainchant melodies and multi-voiced polyphonic compositions, of elite and popular musics, of written and unwritten musical practices, and of sacred and secular realms of activity, BENEDICAMUS offers innovative historical perspectives and conceptual possibilities.

Impact: BENEDICAMUS’s potential for ground-breaking research resides in the following: (1) It undermines and contextualises accepted historiographical watersheds (notably that between the Middle Ages and the Renaissance), uncovering unexpected continuities across time and place, and blurring definitions of the liturgical, the sacred, and the secular. (2) It forges new methods of musical analysis to identify, in surviving written documents, traces of ad hoc or improvisatory musical practices never recorded on parchment. Reading beyond the surface of extant notated documents, BENEDICAMUS substantially enriches understandings of ephemeral music-making before 1500, developing ways of recovering and thinking about aspects of the past for which we lack explicit evidence. (3) It directly addresses timely and previously marginalised questions of gender. It explores the unusual predominance of Benedictamus Domino compositions in books from women’s monastic communities, enriching still emerging understandings of female literacy and musicality before 1500. (4) It offers broad interdisciplinary contexts for thinking about artistic creativity and experimentation, particularly in an often marginalised time-period where these concepts are little considered. (5) It engages with the beginnings of musical and poetic genres and techniques that were crucial in shaping practices still current today, and reflects on music’s enduringly complex relationship with spirituality, ritual, and the sacred. (6) It encounters the sounding reality of musical compositions and practices for Benedictamus Domino through collaboration with the internationally renowned performance ensemble Sequentia (https://www.sequentia.org), bringing to life works that have not been heard for centuries.

State of the Art and Rationale for Proposed Research: WP1: Liturgy and Ritual: Owing to its flexibility, knowledge of the precise ways in which Benedictamus Domino (hereafter BD) was used in the liturgy and the melodies to which it was sung remains very incomplete (Robertson 1988, Hiley 1993). In addition to its dual use as a closing versicle in both Mass and Office, BD also featured outside these strictly “interior” liturgical contexts as part of sacred processions. Its multipurpose nature has made the versicle difficult to study: unlike other medieval chants which consistently appear in a fixed place in a fixed type of liturgical book, BD melodies are itinerant. As a result, there exists no comprehensive catalogue of melodies for BD, and modern inventories of liturgical books rarely list BD chants (see Robertson 1988). Furthermore, there was a substantial unwritten tradition of creating BD melodies by borrowing sections of existing plainchant melodies and re-texting them with the words BD. Robertson (1988) has demonstrated that the borrowing and re-texting of BD melodies was a widespread and largely ad hoc and unwritten practice, undertaken by singers on-the-spot. In consequence, the surviving repertoire of plainchant melodies for BD is unusually incomplete and poorly served by scholarly resources.

Thanks to its inherent musical and functional flexibility, BD plainchants enjoyed a rich tradition of monophonic embellishment from the early 11th century, through the creation of tropes: added sections of text and/or melody that expanded upon the textual and musical ideas of the original BD chants. No comprehensive study has been devoted to early monophonic BD tropes (despite the existence of such
volumes for other kinds of tropes; Jacobson 1975-2009). The burst of creativity in monophonic BD tropes in the 1000s and its generative role in the development of later polyphonic BD embellishments remains opaque.

Little is known about the ritual role played by BD plainchants and tropes: in which locations were they sung, and by whom? BENEDICAMUS builds on scattered and preliminary answers to these questions (Harrison 1958, Barclay 1977, Boynton and Rice 2008). It examines celebratory and informal clerical contexts for BD (sketched in Arlt 1970), which play with conventional demarcations of sacred and secular. As such, WP1 addresses significant lacunae in understandings of BD plainchant melodies and tropes and their ritual performance contexts, revealing the complexity and flexibility of liturgical and creative practices before 1100. For the first time, the study of these monophonic BD repertoires (WP1) will both inform and be informed by consideration of later polyphonic repertoires (WP2 and 3), explaining how and why BD was such an important catalyst for the development of new and still current musico-poetic techniques and genres.

WP2: Experimentation and Hybrids: BD is central to the development—c.1100 in Aquitaine in Southern France—of some of the earliest surviving experiments in multi-voiced composition (Marshall 1962, Treitler 1964, Fuller 1969 and 1971). This Aquitanian repertoire represents initial attempts at the creation and notation of polyphony, a defining characteristic of Western musical composition as we now know it. Although it is widely acknowledged that these early polyphonic compositions usually include the text BD and/or are prescribed for use at this liturgical moment, reasons why this moment inspired such considerable musical and poetic novelty remain unexplored.

BD remained key to advances in polyphonic composition and musical notation at the cathedral of Notre Dame in Paris c.1200. Harrison’s theory (1958) that polyphonic 13th-century Latin conductus songs, which often conclude with this text, could have been sung in the place of the BD in the Parisian liturgy merits proper investigation. So does Roesner’s (2009) suggestion that the unusual placement of a small group of two-voice BD settings within a conductus song collection functioned as probable BD “cadas” that could be appended to the end of a conductus song in order to make explicit its liturgical or ritual function. Investigations by the PI (Bradley 2018) have uncovered further evidence of the existence and circulation of self-contained polyphonic BD cadas for 13th-century conducti. This ad hoc addition of BD cadas to polyphonic Latin songs c.1200 constitutes a striking continuity with ad hoc monophonic practices of borrowed BD plainchant melodies (WP1), but these repertoires have not previously been linked.

The role played by experimental compositional traditions surrounding BD c.1100 in the advent of the new and enduring Parisian genre of the motet c.1200 has been hotly debated. (Jammers 1971, Arlt 1986, Tischler 1982, Danckwardt 1984 and 1999). And the continued prevalence of BD texts in experimental and hybrid generic contexts c.1200-1300 (acknowledged in Everist 2018) requires interrogation. Established historiographical boundaries have obscured the multi-directional intersections between various 11th-, 12th-, and 13th-century monophonic and polyphonic genres, noted only in isolated cases: polyphonic motets and monophonic tropes (Traub 1985, Planchart 2003); motets and early Aquitanian polyphony; motets and conductus songs (Everist 2018). Creative practices surrounding BD offer a conceptual framework in which inter-generic exchanges emerge and experimental generic hybrids are accommodated and rationalised, with significant consequences for current understandings and definitions of medieval musical and poetic genres.

WP3: Contexts: Convents and Carols: Only recently have scholars become fully aware of the richness of intellectual and musical life in women’s monastic communities (e.g. Burton and Stöber 2015, Hamburger, Schlotheuber, Marti, and Fassler, 2016), an area of study that has previously been largely overlooked or marginalised. Initial investigations by the PI have established, for the first time, that music for BD is noticeably prominent in manuscripts linked to convents, especially in the 1300s: why did nuns prioritise music for this ritual moment in their daily Offices? Several 14th-century sources that stem from convents confirm the geographically-widespread importance of BD in women’s communities, and merit consideration from this new perspective: books from St George’s Convent in Prague (Vlňová-Wörner 2018); a manuscript from the Spanish convent of Las Huelgas (Barclay 1977, Catalunya 2016); and an as yet unstudied source from a still unidentified convent in Northern Italy (Bologna, Civico Museo Bibliografico Musicale, Q 11: Bassi 2007, Everist 2018). Polyphonic settings of BD in 14th-century sources often employ a relatively simple style, in which a new voice is set, note-against-note, against a pre-existing BD plainchant melody (Cuthbert 2006). This is suggestive of a broader extemporised polyphonic practice, in which polyphony of this kind could easily be improvised against a known plainchant melody. Such practices of simple polyphony for BD c.1300-1400 have yet to be contextualised within earlier ad hoc and flexible practices of monophonic and polyphonic creation (WP1 and 2).
The emergence of the new popular polyphonic genre of the carol c.1300 shows close ties to BD, frequently featuring this text as a refrain. Yet the relationship between carols and existing practices for BD—in terms of their liturgical function and generic identity—remains little understood. The possibility that carols might be sung in place of BD in the liturgy was mooted by Harrison (1958), who later drew attention (1965) to a 14th-century Italian manuscript (Aosta, Seminario maggiore D16, containing carols explicitly identified by rubrics for liturgical use in place of the BD), which has not been studied since. Caldwell (2013) has underlined connections between Latin carols and earlier conductus songs, and the historical networks of several individual carols have been described (Ameln 1970, 1985, Lipphardt 1973). Yet the major studies of the two principal 14th-century sources to contain such Latin carols remain Stein 1956 and Irtenkauf 1956. Carols before 1500 usefully connect past and present, since many of their melodies continue to reside in living musical memory and in folk traditions (Strohm 2009). Contextualising carols within earlier BD practices (WP1 and 2) offers new cultural perspectives, providing an important back-story for medieval tunes that circulated widely and continue to be sung across Europe in various sacred and secular contexts.

**Summary:** Scholarly understandings in the following areas remain incomplete: (1) The state of the monophonic repertoire of BD melodies and their ritual functions c.1000-1100 (WP1); (2) The role of BD in the development of new poetic and musical (polyphonic) techniques and genres c.1100-1300 (WP2); (3) The function and significance of BD in communities of sacred women and in devotional or popular performance practices c.1300-1500 (WP3); (4) The relationship between oral (unwritten or extemporised) musical practices and literate composition, and the status of creative activities at the boundaries between orality and literacy (WP1, 2, and 3). The findings of BENEDICAMUS’s three work packages coalesce to fill these significant gaps in existing knowledge, advancing the conceptual possibilities of the current state of the art by allowing diverse works and genres to be newly understood within as yet uncharted historical and cultural contexts.

**Methodology:** BENEDICAMUS is thoroughly interdisciplinary combining approaches from musicology, liturgical studies, theology, palaeography, codicology, manuscript studies, digital humanities, history, cultural studies, and literary studies. Methodologically, the fundamental objective of BENEDICAMUS—to explore musical and poetic creative practices surrounding a particular liturgical and ritual moment c.1000-1500—is new and innovative. Music histories before 1500 have not previously been conceptualised or approached in this way, but still tend to be centered on particular composers (Meconi 2018, Planchart 2019), places (Saucier 2014, Parkes 2015), genres (Zayaruznaya 2015), or sources (Alden 2010). Traditional periodisations—medieval (Everist 2018), late medieval (Zayaruznaya 2015), and renaissance (Anderson 2014)—continue to define their chronological scope.

**BD** offers a highly specific focus that is simultaneously open to multiple perspectives. As a “moment” it belongs to the liturgy, as well as to sacred processions, and devotional and festive contexts. Although it could be considered as a genre of liturgical plainchant, the exceptional persistence of music for BD in various polyphonic and non-liturgical contexts extends its status beyond that of a straightforward generic category. This differentiates BENEDICAMUS from studies that have examined other plainchant “genres”—e.g. the Kyrie eleison (Landwehr-Melnicki 1955) or the Tract (Hornby 2002)—and which are necessarily confined exclusively to monophonic and liturgical contexts.

BENEDICAMUS benefits from many advantages of a micro-historical approach: it uses a single ritual moment to ask bigger questions about music history. Yet in scope, the various genres and practices that BD encompasses, and the radically different forms that it can assume across time, are much more substantial and widespread than the subject of a typical micro history. This makes BD an especially provocative and productive object of study for a *longue durée* history.

BENEDICAMUS affords creative objects and practices a central role in shaping its historical and analytical approaches, constructing its larger contextual picture through case studies. This moves beyond the purely philological aims of much previous scholarship of music before 1500 (e.g. Ludwig 1910, Van der Werf 1989) and addresses a tendency to trace general trends and adopt assumed stylistic and evolutionary narratives and categories (e.g. Anderson 1969, 1971) rather than engaging with individual works on an analytical level. Music before 1500 lacks the well-developed analytical systems that exist for later (tonal) musics, and there is a paucity of contemporaneous theoretical or circumstantial evidence that might help to establish such tools. BENEDICAMUS’s analytical approaches therefore proceed “from first principles” and are tailored to the nature of the material at hand, responding to features of a particular work that emerge as unusually pronounced or unconventional in the repertoire at large. These case studies serve as methodological blueprints for future analysis: they proffer possible and much-needed “ways in” to musical
repertoires whose lack of formal analytical methods has often discouraged close engagement. Collaboration with the performance group Sequentia allows BENEDICAMUS to profit from the expertise of world-leading musicians who are already intimately acquainted with the practicalities of realising its musical repertoires in sound. A workshop with these performers will allow the team to test possible interpretations of musical works and to gain new insights that arise only in the process of translating musical notations into song.

**WP1: Liturgy and Ritual:** Postdoc 1 (a liturgist/theologian) will provide the main contributions to WP1, under the guidance of the PI, who—acknowledging the work of Postdoc 1—will build on and contextualise data and case studies from this WP in the project monograph. WP1 addresses the lack of a current catalogue for BD plainchant melodies. Existing skeleton Beneficamuses catalogues will be used as a basis: the 107 melodies in Barclay 1977 and the 44 melodies in Huglo 1982. These catalogues will be expanded by a search of chant manuscripts now available online in digital facsimiles and a visit to the Bruno-Stäblein-Archiv of plainchant manuscript microfilms in Würzburg. It is anticipated that c.300 BD sources will be surveyed, and c.150 new BD melodies uncovered. Using the searchable Volpiano plainchant font, results will be recorded in an electronic database of melodies (an open tool to which users can add comments, published on the project website). New understandings of trends in plainchant practices for BD made possible by the database will be communicated through case-study articles. These will be contextualised within a broader exploration of ritual and performance contexts of chants and their related poetic embellishments (tropes).

**WP2: Experimentation and Hybrids:** The PI will manage this WP, beginning with a systematic scrutiny of the repertoire of c.70 polyphonic works in 12th-century Aquitanian sources that represent some of the earliest experiments in multi-voiced composition. Innovative analytical and compositional approaches to better understand newly-developed techniques in the creation and circulation of polyphony c.1100 include: (1) the definition of a body of established musical and poetic formulae, allowing their role in compositional processes and as mnemonic tools for the performer to be assessed; (2) a new typology of variants as indications of performative practices and written or oral aspects of musical transmission; (3) the definition of a musical grammar for Aquitanian polyphony to support experiments in creative re-construction/composition (following Barclay 1978) to test the possibility that pieces transmitted monophonically in Aquitanian sources were plausibly intended to be combined polyphonically with BD plainchant melodies. Particular analytical attention will be devoted to the 12th-century compositions based on quotations of BD plainchant melodies whose relationship to the later genre of the motet is debated.

Attempts to reveal unwritten musical practices that are not explicitly recorded in manuscript sources will proceed as follows. An unwritten tradition of BD codas that were freely added to 13th-century conductus songs will be established: building on Falck’s initial investigations (1981), and using the Cantum pulcriorem invenire database, conductus songs that conclude with poetic lines whose syllable counts or rhymes would be sympathetic to the addition of BD will be identified. A corpus of confirmed and possible BD codas will be defined (with reference to Bukofzer 1953, Falck 1981, Knapp 1990, Bradley 2018). Musical analysis will assess tonal and melodic compatibility to show if and how certain codas could be appended to suitable host conductus songs.

**WP3: Contexts: Convents and Carols:** Under the supervision of the PI, Postdoc 2 (a Latin specialist) will provide the main contributions to WP3, and two musicology PhD candidates will complete theses. The PI will unite and develop the various strands of this WP in the project monograph. The two PhD candidates will undertake separate projects centered on particular 14th-century manuscripts containing settings of BD, which require similar training and skills. These projects are self-contained and identifiably discrete, while simultaneously engaging with and enhancing larger issues central to BENEDICAMUS as a whole.

PhD 1 will write a thesis on the role of BD in women’s monastic communities, principally focused on the unedited manuscript Bologna Q 11 (containing a large number of BD settings from an as yet unidentified Northern Italian convent). The PI will develop this theme within a broader survey of BD settings linked to convents, asking if and why the 14th century represented a high-point of such musical activity in women’s monastic communities. This work advances the agenda of feminist musicology and adjusts its perspective, since there is a still pervasive tendency to focus on named female composers (Bain 2015, Meconi 2018), rather than on the creative communities within which women make music.

PhD 2 will write a thesis centered on the Aosta manuscript (D16), illuminating the status of its explicitly liturgical carols—prescribed for use in place of the BD—and analysing its compositional techniques in relation to other simple polyphonic works from Italy c.1300. Close musical engagement with
these simple settings advances a new analytical agenda, since the more “complex” repertoire of motets continues to dominate the analysis of 14th-century music (Zayaruznaya 2015, Desmond 2018).

Postdoc 2 will focus primarily on the repertoire of Latin-texted carols and sacred songs \textit{(cantiones)}, c.1300-1500, which have the most direct connections to earlier BD traditions. Postdoc 2 will undertake a systematic analysis of the texts of the c.200 Latin carols in two principal 14th-century sources (the Moosburger graduale and the Seckau cantorarium), identifying continuities of poetic practice within carol texts and related genres—contemporary monophonic BD tropes (catalogued in Haug 1995) and 13th-century conductus songs (searching texts in the \textit{Cantum pulchriorum invenire} database)—to test the significance of inter-generic connections that have been only superficially acknowledged (Harrison 1958, Caldwell 2013). This offers a basis to select case studies of Latin carols that appear in a variety of geographical and generic contexts across a wide chronological span, encompassing at least one carol that has multiple poetic identities and an unbroken performance tradition to the present day. Seeking to understand the repertoire of carols before 1500 principally through the lens of individual songs—whose texts traverse multiple manuscript sources, performance contexts, languages, and geographical borders—represents a new departure from the source-focused (Hlávková-Mrčíková 2013) or regional emphases (Fallows 2018) of previous studies.

\textit{Intersection of Work Packages:} Each WP focuses principally on a particular time-period (WP1 1000-1100; WP2 1100-1300; WP3 1300-1500) but all three WPs seek broad and multi-faceted understandings of the same object of study—BD—necessarily addressing shared themes. Two key concepts span the entire chronological range of the project, and will be starting points for co-authored journal articles. (1) The importance of unwritten, \textit{ad hoc}, or improvised musical practices and how such practices might be intuited or uncovered analytically in surviving written sources, both within and beyond the realm of BD. (2) The porous boundaries of musical and poetic genres, usually the subject of separate studies. One co-authored journal article, for example, will trace the fate of a single BD melody from c.1000-1500 (across all three WPs) across multiple genres in manuscript sources from Cambridge to Zagreb.

\textbf{Feasibility and Implementation:}

\textit{Feasibility and Risk Analysis:} Project risk is mitigated by the PI’s interdisciplinary experience and established international networks. The PI held a ten-month EURIAS fellowship at the Paris Institute for Advanced Study in 2017-18 dedicated to a review of relevant literature, gathering of materials, and initial proof-of-concept investigations for the entire project. She laid much of the archival ground-work for WP2 and delivered pilot conference papers on aspects of this WP. The risk factor of WP2 is, therefore, low. BENEDICAMUS will be supported by a Scientific Advisory Board of six world-leading scholars in directly relevant research fields, with expertise weighted towards WP1 and 3, including a specialist in digital plainchant research, Jennifer Bain, to assist with the conception and construction of the BD database (WP1). Potential risks to the successful completion of WP1 and 3 will be assuaged by the recruitment of Postdoc candidates with the desired expertise and training. The networks of the PI and Advisory Board will allow recruitment calls to be widely broadcast in fruitful contexts. The PI will hold a Wigeland Fellowship at the University of Chicago in early 2020 (before the commencement of the grant period) to undertake planning work for WP1 in consultation with Anne Walters Robertson. Although WP3 involves a wide-ranging body of material, the source-focused approaches of the PhDs ensure results that will constitute ground-breaking research in their own right. As host institution, the University of Oslo offers a rich scholarly environment, with dedicated administrative support (equivalent to 40% of a departmental administrator’s time over 5 years), excellent resources, and networks that are conducive to rigorous and well-managed research.

\textit{Project Team:} BENEDICAMUS will consist of Catherine A. Bradley as PI (75% over 60 months); \textbf{Postdoc 1} (100% over 48 months) with expertise in theology and liturgy; \textbf{Postdoc 2} (100% over 48 months) a Latinist, with a historical or literary/linguistic training; \textbf{PhD Student 1 and 2} (100% over 36 months) with musicology backgrounds; a \textit{database technician} (20% over 48 months); a \textit{research assistant} (20% over 60 months); and an interdisciplinary \textit{Scientific Advisory Board} consisting of world-leading experts in directly related fields (all members confirmed): Jennifer Bain (Dalhousie University); Benjamin Bagby (Sorbonne University, Paris, co-founder and director of \textit{Sequentia}); Margot Fassler (University of Notre Dame); Andreas Haug (University of Würzburg); and Hana Vlhoňová-Wörner (Charles University, Prague). The Advisory Board will participate actively, attending workshops, offering feedback, helping to identify and avoid scholarly pitfalls, and to expand and build networks.
**Activities:** The project group will have informal bi-weekly status meetings with monthly internal research seminars, to develop ideas and present work in progress, review relevant literature, and brainstorm potential research obstacles. Two of the monthly internal seminars per year will be attended by invited external guests. The PhD students will receive tri-weekly supervision and the PI and Postdocs will have tri-weekly co-author meetings to prepare cross-WP articles. There will be three two-day workshops with the Advisory Board and a mid-project exchange workshop with the *Corpus Monodicum* team at the University of Würzburg. The project will close with an international two-day conference linked to a public research-performance workshop with the ensemble *Sequentia* and a concert of a specially-curated programme designed in collaboration with the BENEDICAMUS team to include newly-edited music and to reflect the project’s concept. This will be followed by a two-day recording session to produce a commercially available CD recording of music from BENEDICAMUS, including works never previously recorded on disc.

**Dissemination:** Research outputs of BENEDICAMUS will include: a monograph authored by the PI; a volume of essays co-edited by the PI and Postdoc 1 and 2; two PhD theses; a database of *BD* plainchant melodies; a curated CD recording by *Sequentia*; a total of c.10 articles (including co-authored cross-WP articles) and c.30 international conference and seminar presentations by team members. Knowledge transfer will also occur through a project website, dedicated project social media channels, a public workshop with *Sequentia*, and short promo- and transfer-of-knowledge videos.
References


Bradley


